

State of Utah

Division of Facilities Construction & Management

Department of Administrative Services 4110 State Office Building Salt Lake City, Utah 84114 Phone (801) 538-3018 Fax (801) 538-3267

MEMORANDUM

Date: September 30, 2004

To: Interested Parties

From: Francis Xavier Lilly, DFCM

Reference: University of Utah

Utah Museum of Natural History DFCM Project No. 02243750

Subject: Short Listing

DFCM and the University of Utah would like to thank all of the firms that expressed interest in pursuing the design of the new Utah Museum of Natural History. Following the evaluations of statements of qualifications and past performance, the selection committee invites the following firms to proceed to the next stage of the selection:

Antoine Predock Architect / EDA Architecture
Cooper Roberts Simonsen / Fentress Bradburn Architects, Ltd.
Douglas J. Cardinal Architect, Ltd.
Hammell, Green, and Abrahamson, Inc.
Pei Cobb Freed and Partners / FFKR Architects
Polshek Partnership / GSBS, PC
VCBO Architecture / Moshe Safdie and Associates

Prequalified teams will be notified of important travel information by 4:00 pm MST tomorrow, Friday, 1 October, 2004.

A scoring summary will be issued to all competing firms by 10:00 am MST tomorrow, Friday, 1 October, 2004.

VBS Selection Final Scoring Matrix

University of Utah Utah Museum of Natural History - Design Selection Stage I: Prequalification DFCM Project No. 02243750

30 September 2004

	Short Listed Teams																								
Points Possible	Points Awarded																								
10	8	9	8	7	8	9	7	8	8	5	8	9	8	7	5	8	7	7	8	8	8	7	9	8	5
90	52	85	83	59	75	53	75	63	60	80	62	70	63	58	55	48	60	58	61	65	54	80	56	57	45
100	60	94	91	66	83	62	82	71	68	85	70	79	71	65	60	56	67	65	69	73	62	87	65	65	50
			78.8			73.6						69.0						66.0			65.8				
	4	1	1	3	2	2	3	2	2	1	1	4	2	4	5	6	7	5	1	3	2	2	5	4	8
		1				2			3					4						5					
	Possible 10 90	10 8 90 52	Possible	Possible 10 8 9 8 90 52 85 83 100 60 94 91	90 52 85 83 59 100 60 94 91 66 78.8 66 66 66 66	Possible 10 8 9 8 7 8 90 52 85 83 59 75 100 60 94 91 66 83 78.8	Possible 10 8 9 8 7 8 9 90 52 85 83 59 75 53 100 60 94 91 66 83 62 78.8	Possible 10 8 9 8 7 8 9 7 90 52 85 83 59 75 53 75 100 60 94 91 66 83 62 82 78.8	Possible 10 8 9 8 7 8 9 7 8 90 52 85 83 59 75 53 75 63 100 60 94 91 66 83 62 82 71 78.8 73.6 4 1 1 3 2 2 3 2	Possible 10 8 9 8 7 8 9 7 8 8 90 52 85 83 59 75 53 75 63 60 100 60 94 91 66 83 62 82 71 68 78.8 73.6 4 1 1 3 2 2 3 2 2	Possible 10 8 9 8 7 8 9 7 8 8 5 90 52 85 83 59 75 53 75 63 60 80 100 60 94 91 66 83 62 82 71 68 85 78.8 73.6 4 1 1 3 2 2 3 2 2 1	Points Possible 10 8 9 8 7 8 9 7 8 8 5 8 90 52 85 83 59 75 53 75 63 60 80 62 100 60 94 91 66 83 62 82 71 68 85 70 78.8 73.6 4 1 1 3 2 2 3 2 2 1 1	Points Possible Points 10 8 9 8 7 8 9 7 8 8 5 8 9 90 52 85 83 59 75 53 75 63 60 80 62 70 100 60 94 91 66 83 62 82 71 68 85 70 79 78.8 73.6 4 1 1 3 2 2 3 2 2 1 1 4	Points Possible Points Average Possible 10 8 9 8 7 8 9 7 8 8 5 8 9 8 90 52 85 83 59 75 53 75 63 60 80 62 70 63 100 60 94 91 66 83 62 82 71 68 85 70 79 71 78.8 73.6 69.0 4 1 1 3 2 2 3 2 2 1 1 4 2	Points Possible Points Awarded 10 8 9 8 7 8 9 7 8 8 5 8 9 8 7 90 52 85 83 59 75 53 75 63 60 80 62 70 63 58 100 60 94 91 66 83 62 82 71 68 85 70 79 71 65 78.8 73.6 69.0	Points Possible Points Awarded 10 8 9 8 7 8 9 7 8 8 5 8 9 8 7 5 90 52 85 83 59 75 53 75 63 60 80 62 70 63 58 55 100 60 94 91 66 83 62 82 71 68 85 70 79 71 65 60 78.8 73.6 59.0	Points Possible Points Awarded 10 8 9 8 7 8 9 7 8 8 5 8 9 8 7 5 8 90 52 85 83 59 75 53 75 63 60 80 62 70 63 58 55 48 100 60 94 91 66 83 62 82 71 68 85 70 79 71 65 60 56 78.8 73.6 69.0 4 1 1 3 2 2 3 2 2 1 1 4 2 4 5 6	Points Possible Points Awarded 10 8 9 8 7 8 9 7 8 8 5 8 9 8 7 5 8 7 90 52 85 83 59 75 53 75 63 60 80 62 70 63 58 55 48 60 100 60 94 91 66 83 62 82 71 68 85 70 79 71 65 60 56 67 78.8 73.6 69.0	Points Possible Points Awarded 10 8 9 8 7 8 9 7 8 8 5 8 9 8 7 5 8 7 7 90 52 85 83 59 75 53 75 63 60 80 62 70 63 55 48 60 58 100 60 94 91 66 83 62 82 71 68 85 70 79 71 65 60 56 67 65 78.8 73.6 50.0 66.0 4 1 1 3 2 2 3 2 2 1 1 4 2 4 5 6 7 5	Points Possible Points Awarded 10 8 9 8 7 8 9 7 8 8 5 8 9 8 7 5 8 7 7 8 90 52 85 83 59 75 53 75 63 60 80 62 70 63 58 55 48 60 58 61 100 60 94 91 66 83 62 82 71 68 85 70 79 71 65 60 56 67 65 69 78.8 73.6 69.0 66.0 4 1 1 3 2 2 3 2 2 1 1 4 2 4 5 6 7 5 1	Points Possible Points Awarded 10 8 9 8 7 8 9 7 8 8 5 8 9 8 7 7 8 8 90 52 85 83 59 75 53 75 63 60 80 62 70 63 58 55 48 60 58 61 65 100 60 94 91 66 83 62 82 71 68 85 70 79 71 65 60 56 67 65 69 73 78.8 73.6 69.0 66.0 4 1 1 3 2 2 3 2 1 1 4 2 4 5 6 7 5 1 3	Points Possible Points Awarded 10 8 9 8 7 8 9 7 8 8 5 8 9 8 7 5 8 7 7 8 8 8 90 52 85 83 59 75 53 75 63 60 80 62 70 63 58 55 48 60 58 61 65 54 100 60 94 91 66 83 62 82 71 68 85 70 79 71 65 60 56 67 65 69 73 62 78.8 73.6 Figure 10" 66.0 4 1 1 3 2 2 3 2 1 1 4 2 4 5 6 7 5 1 3 2	Points Possible Points Awarded 10 8 9 8 7 8 9 7 8 8 5 8 9 8 7 7 8 8 8 7 90 52 85 83 59 75 53 75 63 60 80 62 70 63 55 48 60 58 61 65 54 80 100 60 94 91 66 83 62 82 71 68 85 70 79 71 65 60 56 67 65 69 73 62 87 4 1 1 3 2 2 3 2 2 1 1 4 2 4 5 6 7 5 1 3 2 2	Points Possible Points Awarded 10 8 9 8 7 8 9 7 8 8 5 8 9 8 7 7 8 8 8 7 9 90 52 85 83 59 75 53 75 63 60 80 62 70 63 58 55 48 60 58 61 65 54 80 56 100 60 94 91 66 83 62 82 71 68 85 70 79 71 65 60 56 67 65 69 73 62 87 65 4 1 1 3 2 2 3 2 2 1 1 4 2 4 5 6 7 5 1 3 2 2 5	Points Possible Points Awarded 10 8 9 8 7 8 9 7 8 8 5 8 9 8 7 7 8 8 8 7 9 8 90 52 85 83 59 75 53 75 63 60 80 62 70 63 58 55 48 60 58 61 65 54 80 56 57 100 60 94 91 66 83 62 82 71 68 85 70 79 71 65 60 56 67 65 69 73 62 87 65 65 4 1 1 3 2 2 3 2 1 1 4 2 4 5 6 7 5 1 3 2 2 5 4

Teams					Sh	ort List	ed Teams				A					В					С					
Selection Criteria	Points Possible		Points Awarded																							
Past Performance	10	10	10	9	6	10	9	9	9	7	6	9	9	9	7	8	8	8	8	7	8	9	8	8	8	6
Strength of Team	90	47	65	42	51	60	43	70	43	40	50	33	45	49	52	40	24	50	37	46	50	25	50	58	44	25
Total	100	57	75	51	57	70	52	79	52	47	56	42	54	58	59	48	32	58	45	53	58	34	58	66	52	31
Average Score				62.0			57.2							52.2	52.2			49.2								
Scorer Rank		5	6	11	7	4	7	4	10	11	7	10	10	7	6	9	15	8	13	8	6	14	8	4	9	14
Final Rank			6						7					8					9					10		

Firms			D						E				F					G					н				
Selection Criteria	Points Possible		Points Awarded												l												
Past Performance	10	9	9	8	7	8	9	9	7	7	6	9	8	8	6	8	8	6	6	4	5	10	9	5	5	5	
Strength of Team	90	34	35	49	42	30	32	40	48	35	34	30	35	41	35	38	40	40	38	30	35	25	20	35	38	22.5	
Total	100	43	44	57	49	38	41	49	55	42	40	39	43	49	41	46	48	46	44	34	40	35	29	40	43	27.5	
Average Score				46.2			45.4					43.6							42.4		34.9						
Scorer Rank		9	13	8	10	13	11	11	9	13	11	12	14	12	14	10	8	12	14	15	11	13	15	15	12	15	
Final Rank			11						12			13					14						15				

Note: These scores are listed for the benefit of the firms that were not short-listed. The scores of the short-listed firms will not be identified, as the selection committee reserves the right to modify the scores at the time of the selection interview.